Identifying, Understanding and Translating the Metaphors of a Dead Language: How to Move Beyond the Denotation of the Words to the Connotation of the Words.

> Dr. Joel M. Hoffman Hebrew Union College Joel@Huc.Edu

Leuven. July 6, 1998.

"When I use a word,"
Humpty Dumpty said, "it
means just what I choose it to
mean — neither more nor less."
"The question is," said Alice, "whether you can make
words mean so many different
things"

"The question is," said
Humpty Dumpy, "which is to
be master — that is all."

(Lewis Carol)

1 Background Assumptions

- (1) Dead languages are qualitatively the same as living ones.
- (2) The best way to test a method of inquiry is when the conclusions can be checked by independent means.

2 Conclusions

(3) Etymology and cognate languages are only tangentially rele-

- vant to meaning.
- (4) Word-level literal meaning contributes unevenly to sentencelevel literal meaning.
- (5) (Sometimes the "meaning" isn't the most important part of a text; some texts have no "meaning.")

3 On Meaning

- (6) At least three types of meaning (or three points on a spectrum) can be discerned:
 - (a) Literal.
 - i. The disease attacked his heart.
 - ii. The car is blue.
 - (b) Metaphoric.
 - i. His heart isn't in it (=he doesn't care about it).
 - ii. He's feeling blue (=he's feeling sad).
 - (c) Idiomatic.
 - i. To learn by heart (=to memorize).
 - ii. Once in a blue moon (=seldom).
- (7) Idioms differ from metaphors is that the former are arbitrary.
- (8) A word can simultaneously have literal, metaphoric and idiomatic uses (as above).
- (9) Generally, only literal meanings translate successfully word-for-word. Metaphors and idioms do not.
 - (a) French
 - i. La voiture est bleue (literal)
 - ii. N'y voir que du *blue* [to see only blue] (=not to understand, "to be left in the dark")
 - iii. Avoir une peur bleue [to have a blue fear] (=to fear "to be scared stiff")

iv. Être dans une colère bleue [to be in a blue anger] (=to be angry, "to be in a blind rage.")

(b) German

- i. Das automobil ist blau (literal)
- ii. Blau Flecken [blue spots] (=bruises, "black and blue")
- iii. Blau machen [to make blue] (=to skip school, "play hookey")
- iv. Blau sein [to be blue] (=to be drunk)
- v. Blauer Brief [blue letter] (=warning letter sent to parents of school children)

(10) Literal meaning is non-concatitive.

- (a) "Burn up" = "burn down" ("up" \neq "down")
- (b) "Pick," "pick up," (=improve) "pick on," (=annoy) "pick up on" (=discern) have little to do with "up" or "on."
- (c) "By and large" (=usually)
- (d) "Please be advised"
- (e) "... at your earliest convenience"
- (f) "aid and abet" / "jointly and severally" / "will and testament" etc.

(11) Literal meaning is often irrelevant.

- (a) "Sincerely" closing a business letter has nothing to do with sincerity. (Likewise mit freundlichen Grüßen 'with friendly greetings' in German, b'khavod rav 'with great honor' in Modern Hebrew, etc.)
- (b) "It seems to me" in Russian is the usual way of saying "I think."
- (c) "How are you?" in English often means "hi."
- (d) "Thank you" has little to do with thanks.
- (e) Hineini in Biblical texts?

- (f) Vayidabeir Adonai el Moshe leimor... in Biblical texts? ("God spoke unto Moses saying" isn't English.)
- (12) Meaning is sometimes irrelevant.
 - (a) Song of Songs: Shir hashirim asher lishlomo 'a song of songs which is Solomon's:' A song of songs sung for Solomon.
 - (b) Word plays on place names in Genesis.

4 Methods of Inquiry

Of four methods of inquiry, Etymology, cognates, language-internal usage patterns and language-independent usage patterns the final two are the most reliable, even disregarding metaphors and idioms:

4.1 Etymology

- (13) English
 - (a) host/hostile
 - (b) stationary/stationery
 - (c) office/officer/official
 - (d) patent/patently
 - (e) ship/shipping
 - (f) view/re-view/review
 - (g) intern/internal

(14) Modern Hebrew

- (a) l'hitabed ["to get lost"] = to commit suicide
- (b) l'hakriv ["to move further away"] = to sacrifice
- ${\rm (c)} \quad {\rm m'sukan} \ [{\rm ``endangered''}] = {\rm dangerous}$
- (d) nizkarti ["I was remembered"] = I remembered

4.2 Cognate Languages / Borrowing

- (15) Cognates.
 - (a) English "demand" and French demander (=to ask)
 - (b) English "medicine" and French médecin (=doctor)
 - (c) English "he will" and German er will (=he wants)
 - (d) English "star" and German Star (=cataract)
- (16) Borrowing.
 - (a) English "farmer" and Hungarian farmer (=bluejeans)
 - (b) English "express" bus and Modern Hebrew *ekspres* (=local)

4.3 Language-internal usage patterns

- (17) Lakoff etc.
- (18) "Blue" in Modern Hebrew = perversion:
 - (a) Blue movie (=X-rated movie)
 - (b) Blue head (=pervert)
- (19) "Blue" in English = sorrow:
 - (a) Feel/look blue (=sad)
 - (b) The blues (=sorrow)
- (20) "Red" in Russian = beauty
- (21) "Heart" in English.
 - (a) Broken-hearted (=distraught)
 - (b) Have a heart (=kind/generous)
 - (c) His heart isn't in it (=he doesn't care about it)
 - (d) With heavy heart (=unwillingly)
 - (e) To one's heart's content (=as much as one wants)
 - (f) tender/warm/etc. hearted
 - (g) cold hearted

4.4 Language-independent usage patterns

5 A Case Study: Levav & Nefesh in Biblical Hebrew

5.1 Levay

(22) Song of Songs 4:9:

You have levav'd me, my partner, my bride. You have levav'd me with [but] one of your eyes.

לבבתני אחתי כלה. לבבתני באחד מעיניך.

(23) Lev 19:17:

You shall not hate your brother in/with your levav.

לא-תשנא את-אחיך בלבבך.

(24) Deut 28:28:

Adonai will strike you with madness, blindness and confusion of the *levav*.

יככה יי בשגעון ובעורון ובתמנון לבב.

(25) Deut 20:8:

Who is the man who is fearful and weak of levav? Let him return home and not melt the levav of his brother as his [own] levav.

מי האיש הירא ורך הלבב ילך וישב לביתו ולא ימס את-לבב אחיו כלבבו.

(26) Ex 14:5:

[When the king was told that the people had fled] the *levav* of Pharaoh and his servants changed regarding the people. ויהפך לבב פרעה ועבדיו אל-העם.

(27) Deut 7:17:

You say in/with your *levav* [these nations are more numerous than I...]

כי תאמר בלבבך

(28) I Sam 9:19:

[I am the seer...] I will tell you all that is in your levav.

וכל אשר בלבבך אגיד לך.

(29) Deut 30:14:

[the matter is very near to you] in your mouth and in your levav you can do it.

בפיך ובלבבך לעשתו.

(30) Is 6:9:

Lest [this people] see with its eyes, hear with its ears, and its *levav* understand and return and heal it.

פן-יראה בעיניו ובאזניו ישמע ולבבו יבין ושב ורפא לו.

(31) Is 10:7:

His *levav* does not think this way.

ולבבו לא-כן יחשב.

5.2 Nefesh

(32) Gen 1:30:

[To every beast of the earth, to every bird of the sky, and to everything that moves on the earth] within which is a living nefesh.

אשר-בו נפש חיה.

(33) Lev 17:11:

For the *nefesh* of meat/flesh is in the blood and I have put it upon the altar to atone for your *nefesh*'s for it is the blood that atones for the *nefesh*.

כי-נפש הבשר בדם הוא ואני נתתיו לכם אל-המזבח לכפר על-נפשתיכם כי-הדם הוא בנפש יכפר.

(34) I Kings 17:21:

Please let this boy's nefesh come back within him!

תשב-נא נפש-הילד הזה על-קרבו.

(35) I Kings 17:22:

And the *nefesh* of the boy came back within him, and he lived.

ותשב נפש-הילד על-קרבו ויחי.

(36) Gen 35:18:

When/as her nefesh left she died.

ויהי בצאת נפשה כי מתה.

(37) Gen 46:18:

[Zilpah] bore these [children] to Jacob: 16 nefesh's.

ותלד את-אלה ליעקב שש עשרה נפש.

(38) Ex 23:9:

[Do not oppress the stranger for] you know/knew the *nefesh* of the stranger.

וגר לא תלחץ ואתם ידעתם את-נפש הגר.

(39) Lev 4:2:

A *nefesh* that sins unintentionally.

נפש כי-תחטא בשגגה.

(40) Lev 7:27:

Any *nefesh* that eats any blood.

כל-נפש אשר-תאכל כל-דם.

(41) Lev 17:15:

Any nefesh that eats what has died or been torn by beasts.

כל-נפש אשר תאכל נבלה וטרפה.

(42) Lev 24:17:

A man who wounds [mortally?] the *nefesh* of any person shall be put to death.

ואיש כי יכה כל-נפש אדם מות יומת.

(43) Lev 24:18:

And the wounder [mortally?] of the *nefesh* of an animal shall pay for it: a *nefesh* for a *nefesh*.

ומכה נפש-בהמה ישלמנה נפש תחת נפש.

(44) Num 6:6:

[A Nazirite] shall not approach the *nefesh* of a dead person. על-נפש מת לא יבא.

(45) Deut 24:7:

A man who steals a *nefesh* from [among] his brothers, from [among] the children of Israel.

איש גנב נפש מאחיו מבני-ישראל.

5.3 Levav and Nefesh

(46) Deut 6:5:

You shall love Adonai with all your *levav* and all your *ne-fesh...*

ואהבת את יי אלהיך בכל-לבבך ובכל-נפשך

(47) Deut 4:29:

If you search for [God] with all your levav and all your nefesh.

כי תדרשנו בכל-לבבך ובכל נפשך.

(48) Deut 10:12:

And to serve Adonai your God with all your *levav* and all your *nefesh*.

ולעבד את-יי בכל-לבבך ובכל-נפשך.

(49) Deut 26:16:

You shall keep and do them with all your levav and all your nefesh.

ושמרת ועשית אותם בכל-לבבך ובכל-נפשך.

(50) Josh 22:5:

To serve [God] with all your levav and all your nefesh.

ולעבדו בכל-לבבכם וכבל-נפשכם.

(51) Josh 23:14:

You know with all your *levav* and all your *nefesh*.

וידעתם בכל-לבבכם וכבל-נפשכם.

Suggested Reading

- Eco, U. 1992. Interpretation and Overinterpretation. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.
- HIRSCH, A. 1967. Validity in Interpretation. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- HOFSTADTER, D. 1985. Metamagical Themas: Questing for the Essence of Mind and Pattern. New York: Basic Books, Inc.
- —— 1997. Le Ton beau de Marot: In Praise of the Music of Language. New York: Basic Books.
- LAKOFF, G. 1987. Women, Fire, and Dangerous Things. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Putnam, H. 1988. Representation and Reality. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

